

# REPORTERS COMMITTEE

FOR FREEDOM OF THE PRESS

1156 15th St. NW, Suite 1020  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
(202) 795-9300  
www.rcfp.org

Bruce D. Brown  
Executive Director  
bbrown@rcfp.org  
(202) 795-9301

## STEERING COMMITTEE

STEPHEN J. ADLER  
*Reuters*

J. SCOTT APPLEWHITE  
*The Associated Press*

WOLF BLITZER  
*CNN*

DAVID BOARDMAN  
*Temple University*

THEODORE J. BOUTROUS, JR.  
*Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP*

MASSIMO CALABRESI  
*Time Magazine*

MANNY GARCIA  
*Pro Publica*

EMILIO GARCIA-RUIZ  
*The Washington Post*

JOSH GERSTEIN  
*POLITICO*

ALEX GIBNEY  
*Jigsaw Productions*

SUSAN GOLDBERG  
*National Geographic*

JAMES GRIMALDI  
*The Wall Street Journal*

LAURA HANDMAN  
*Davis Wright Tremaine*

DIEGO IBARGÜEN  
*Hearst*

KAREN KAISER  
*The Associated Press*

DAVID LAUTER  
*Los Angeles Times*

MARGARET LOW  
*WBUR*

JANE MAYER  
*The New Yorker*

COLLEEN MCCAIN NELSON  
*The McClatchy Company*

MAGGIE MULVIHILL  
*Boston University*

JAMES NEFF  
*The Philadelphia Inquirer*

NORMAN PEARLSTINE  
*The Los Angeles Times*

THOMAS C. RUBIN  
*Stanford Law School*

CHARLIE SAVAGE  
*The New York Times*

JENNIFER SONDAG  
*Bloomberg News*

NABIHA SYED  
*The Markup*

ADAM SYMSON  
*The E.W. Scripps Company*

PIERRE THOMAS  
*ABC News*

SAUNDRA TORRY  
*Freelance*

VICKIE WALTON-JAMES  
*NPR*

JUDY WOODRUFF  
*PBS/The NewsHour*

## HONORARY LEADERSHIP COUNCIL

CHIP BOK  
*Creators Syndicate*

TONY MAURO  
*American Lawyer Media, ret.*

DAHLIA LITHWICK  
*Slate*

ANDREA MITCHELL  
*NBC News*

CAROL ROSENBERG  
*The New York Times*

PAUL STEIGER  
*ProPublica*

*Affiliations appear only  
for purposes of identification.*

By email

June 6, 2020

The Honorable Bill de Blasio  
Mayor, City of New York  
City Hall  
New York, NY 10007

Commissioner Dermot F. Shea  
New York City Police Department  
1 Police Plaza  
New York, NY 10038

Re: Law enforcement targeting journalists during protests

Dear Mayor de Blasio and Commissioner Shea:

As members of the news media and organizations that protect the rights of journalists to gather and report news, the undersigned write to ask that you take immediate, concrete steps to end the series of police arrests and attacks on credentialed and clearly identifiable journalists in New York City in recent days. These incidents occur as, across the country, police have arrested, detained, and threatened journalists, and have physically assaulted them with rubber bullets, pepper spray, tear gas, batons, and fists.

In the cases of threats, arrests, and assaults that we are aware of in New York City, there are indications, many strong, that officers knew the journalist was a member of the press.

Law enforcement officers do not have legal immunity when they violate clearly established rights under the First Amendment. The right of the press to document police activity is foundational to our democracy and has long been recognized and protected by the courts. Beyond, however, the Constitution and the law, any targeting of reporters for doing their jobs—keeping the public informed during an extraordinary period of civil unrest—is beyond the pale in a free society.

The challenges that officers face in policing during times of civil protest do not supersede any of the rights guaranteed by the First Amendment, and moments of crisis demand that we protect the bedrock American ideal of a free press even more zealously.

As Governor Cuomo rightly tweeted on June 3, “A free press is the lifeblood of democracy. Now more than ever, it is critical that reporters & photographers can safely document protests without fear of harm or targeting.” Governor Cuomo confirmed that journalists are “essential—and they must be able to do their jobs. We all depend on them.” Governor

Cuomo is correct. When an officer knows a journalist is a journalist, just one arrest or assault is a profound and clear violation of the First Amendment.

In New York City alone, among other incidents:

- Brendan McDermid, a Reuters photographer, was assaulted by police while taking pictures of arrests at a protest in downtown Brooklyn. McDermid was wearing a vest marked “PRESS,” was carrying a professional camera, and was clearly displaying his press credentials. An officer asked him to move, he complied, and without provocation, the officer lunged at McDermid with a baton, knocked him down, kicked him in the leg, beat his helmet with the baton, and laughed;
- Chris Mathias, a senior reporter on assignment for HuffPost, was violently taken into custody by New York Police Department officers, even though he identified himself as a reporter and was wearing a clearly visible press pass;
- Writer Keith Boykin, while freelancing, said that as he was taking videos and photos of protests, and after informing NYPD officers he was with the press, he was arrested, and only released hours later;
- Robert Bumsted and Maye-E Wong, a videographer and photographer for the Associated Press wearing identification, were surrounded and shoved by NYPD officers, who also shouted expletives at the journalists, while the journalists attempted to explain the press was exempt from curfew. Bumsted and Wong were forced to leave the scene entirely;
- Tyler Blint-Welsh, a reporter for the Wall Street Journal, was hit in the face multiple times with riot shields and pushed to the ground by NYPD, even though his NYPD-issued press badge was clearly visible;
- A Newsday multimedia producer with a press pass taking video of the protests in lower Manhattan was struck with a baton in the back and pushed down, hitting a metal fence. He had on a bike helmet, which cracked. He complained to an officer about what happened, who walked away.

The Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press has documented at least four other incidents in New York City where police detained or assaulted journalists who appear to have been clearly identified as members of the news media and were not physically located among protesters. The U.S. Press Freedom Tracker has confirmed almost thirty incidents of arrest or assault by the police around the country, and the Reporters Committee and the Tracker are investigating several hundred more.

Officers on the ground must understand that gathering news and recording police activities are not crimes, and that journalists who are complying with reasonable law enforcement directions when covering civil unrest are protected by the First Amendment.

In incidents captured on camera in New York City, the journalists were clearly identified as such and indisputably in compliance with the law.

Additionally, officers should recognize that training for journalists and documentarians who cover protests or civil unrest provides guidance on how to interact with law enforcement. They know to comply with an order to move, they will not resist arrest, and they will identify themselves as a member of the news media. At the same time, officers properly trained in crowd control should know that an identifiable journalist may not be arrested or assaulted.

We also strongly urge you to affirmatively order all commanders to instruct their officers that the news media is exempt from curfew orders in New York City, as was clearly stated in the “Finest Message” of June 1.

A general curfew order that fails to provide an exemption for *all* members of the press would violate the First Amendment, and gives law enforcement a potent tool to silence reporting through assaults or arrests of journalists, as we have seen over the past several days. *Cf. Bantam Books, Inc. v. Sullivan*, 372 U.S. 58, 70 (1963) (“Any system of prior restraint of expression comes before this Court bearing a heavy presumption against its constitutional validity.”). Furthermore, that arrest or detention of a reporter during a curfew would itself violate the First Amendment. *See id.*

We appreciate Mayor de Blasio’s tweet early on June 5 confirming that media personnel are essential and exempt from the curfew, and his pledge to “get NYPD to fix this immediately,” but that message *must* filter down to the officers on the ground.

**A. The right to report on police activities is clearly established and officers have no immunity when they directly target reporters covering protests.**

The right of the press to document police activities in public has long been protected by the First Amendment. *See Iacobucci v. Boulter*, 193 F.3d 14, 25 (1st Cir. 1999) (“Because Iacobucci’s [journalistic] activities were peaceful, not performed in derogation of any law, and done in the exercise of his First Amendment rights [police] lacked the authority to stop them.”). News reporting on police conduct serves the crucial First Amendment interest in promoting the “free discussion of governmental affairs.” *Mills v. Alabama*, 384 U.S. 214, 218 (1966).

The right to record police activity, by the press and public, has been held repeatedly to be “clearly established” by many courts around the country. Therefore, a police officer or official who violates that right, especially through the use of force, cannot claim legal immunity. *See Glik v. Cunniffe*, 655 F.3d 78, 83 (1st Cir. 2011) (citing cases); *see also American Civil Liberties Union of Illinois v. Alvarez*, 679 F.3d 583, 595 (7th Cir. 2012) (finding eavesdropping statute barring recording of police activity in public violated First Amendment).

The Department of Justice has taken the position that this right to record law enforcement is a crucial First Amendment protection that should apply across the

country. See Statement of Interest of the United States, *Sharp v. Baltimore City Police Dep't*, No. 1:11-cv-02888-BEL (D. Md. filed Jan. 10, 2012) (“[The right to record is] not only required by the Constitution . . . [it is] consistent with our fundamental notions of liberty, promote[s] the accountability of our governmental officers, and instill[s] public confidence in the police officers who serve us daily.”); see also Statement of Interest of the United States, *Garcia v. Montgomery County*, No. 8:12-cv-03592-JFM (D. Md. filed March 4, 2013) (arguing that discretionary charges like disorderly conduct or disturbing the peace should be viewed skeptically when based on recording police activity).

Journalists, photojournalists, and documentarians deprived of that right are entitled to relief under 42 U.S.C. § 1983, which permits individuals whose rights are violated under color of law to sue the government official responsible. See *Higginbotham v. New York*, 105 F. Supp. 3d 369, 379-80 (S.D.N.Y. 2015) (finding reporter forcibly arrested covering protest stated clearly established First Amendment right-to-record claim sufficient to defeat qualified immunity); see also *Terebesi v. Torreso*, 764 F.3d 217, 231 (2d Cir. 2014) (“Even if this Court has not explicitly held a course of conduct to be unconstitutional, *we may nonetheless treat the law as clearly established* if decisions from this and other circuits *clearly foreshadow a particular ruling on the issue.*”) (emphasis added and internal quotations and citations omitted).

While law enforcement may impose reasonable restrictions on newsgathering to prevent undue interference with legitimate police work, journalists who comply with those restrictions—who stand at a fair remove from any police activity, who obey orders to disperse, and who conspicuously identify themselves as journalists—may not be subject to arrest or physical attack, the quintessential “unreasonable” restriction.

Though physical restraints on newsgathering, such as those which we have seen in New York City in recent days, are thankfully rare and therefore seldom litigated, there is little question that a court would find a “clearly established” First Amendment right of journalists to be free from arrest and the baton.

**B. New York City should immediately implement protocols to protect reporters and ensure the public is informed.**

Accordingly, we urge you to:

- Instruct your officers and staff that the arrest or physical attack of a journalist who is compliant with reasonable police orders is a clearly established First Amendment violation;
- Take swift action to discipline any officer who is found to have arrested or assaulted a journalist engaged in newsgathering;
- Inform your officers that they themselves could be subject to legal liability for violating these rights;

- Ensure that crowd control tactics are appropriate and proportional, and are designed to prevent collateral harm to journalists covering the protests;
- Continue to exempt members of the news media from mobility restrictions, including, and especially, curfews; and
- Release all information about arrests of or physical interactions with the press to the public to allow it to evaluate the legitimacy of police conduct.

Please do not hesitate to contact Bruce Brown, Executive Director of the Reporters Committee, with any questions at [bbrown@rcfp.org](mailto:bbrown@rcfp.org).

Sincerely,

The Reporters Committee  
for Freedom of the Press

American Broadcasting Companies, Inc.  
on behalf of ABC News and WABC-TV, New York  
Advance Publications, Inc.  
ALM Media, LLC  
America's Newspapers  
American Journalism Project  
Article 19  
The Associated Press  
Association of Alternative Newsmedia  
The Atlantic Monthly Group LLC  
Bloomberg News  
Boston Globe Media Partners, LLC  
BuzzFeed  
Cable News Network, Inc.  
California Broadcasters Association  
California News Publishers Association  
CBS Broadcasting Inc., on behalf of  
CBS News and CBS Television  
Stations  
The Center for Investigative Reporting  
(d/b/a Reveal)  
Chalkbeat  
THE CITY  
Colorado Press Association  
Committee to Protect Journalists  
Cox Media Group  
Criminal Justice Journalists  
The Daily Beast Company LLC  
Daily News, LP

Dow Jones & Company, Inc.  
The E.W. Scripps Company  
Fast Company  
First Amendment Coalition  
First Look Media Works, Inc.  
FOX News Media  
Fox Television Stations, LLC  
Freedom of the Press Foundation  
Gannett Co., Inc.  
The Guardian U.S.  
Hearst Corporation  
HuffPost  
Illinois Broadcasters Association  
Illinois Press Association  
Insider Inc.  
Inter American Press Association  
International Center for Journalists  
International Documentary Assn.  
International Federation of Journalists  
International Women's Media  
Foundation  
International Press Institute North  
American Committee  
Investigative Reporting Workshop at  
American University  
Investigative Studios  
James W. Foley Legacy Foundation  
Jewish Currents  
Kansas Press Association  
Las Vegas Review-Journal, Inc.

Los Angeles Times  
 Communications LLC  
 The Marshall Project  
 The McClatchy Company  
 The Media Institute  
 Media Law Resource Center  
 Media Legal Defence Initiative  
 MediaNews Group Inc.  
 Metro Corp. d/b/a Philadelphia and  
 Boston Magazines  
 Michigan Press Association  
 MPA – The Association of Magazine  
 Media  
 Mother Jones  
 National Association of  
 Black Journalists  
 National Association of Broadcasters  
 National Association of  
 Hispanic Journalists  
 National Geographic Partners  
 National Journal Group LLC  
 National Newspaper Association  
 National Press Club Journalism Institute  
 The National Press Club  
 National Press Foundation  
 National Press Photographers  
 Association  
 National Public Radio, Inc.  
 National Writers Union  
 Native American Journalists Association  
 NBCUniversal Media, LLC  
 Nevada Press Association  
 New England First Amendment  
 Coalition  
 New England Newspaper and Press  
 Association, Inc.  
 New York News Publishers Association  
 New York Public Radio  
 The New York Times Company  
 The New Yorker  
 The News Leaders Association  
 News Media Alliance  
 Newsday LLC

The NewsGuild – CWA  
 NowThis News  
 NYP Holdings, Inc.  
 Online News Association  
 Organized Crime and Corruption  
 Reporting Project  
 PEN America  
 POLITICO LLC  
 ProPublica  
 Pulitzer Center on Crisis Reporting  
 Quartz Media, Inc.  
 Radio Television Digital News  
 Association  
 Report for America  
 Reporters Without Borders USA  
 Reuters News & Media Inc.  
 The Seattle Times Company  
 Sinclair Broadcast Group, Inc.  
 Slate  
 Society of Environmental Journalists  
 Society of Professional Journalists  
 Society of Professional Journalists  
 New England  
 South Carolina Press Association  
 South Dakota Newspaper Association  
 Student Press Law Center  
 Tampa Bay Times  
 TEGNA Inc.  
 TIME USA, LLC  
 Tribune Publishing Company  
 Tully Center for Free Speech  
 Univision Communications Inc.  
 Utah Press Association  
 Vermont Press Association  
 Vice Media Group  
 Virginia Press Association  
 Vox Media  
 Washingtonian  
 The Washington Post  
 Weigel Broadcasting Co.  
 WNET  
 Yahoo News

cc: The Honorable Andrew Cuomo  
Governor, State of New York

The Honorable Letitia James  
Attorney General, State of New York

The Honorable Cyrus R. Vance, Jr.  
District Attorney of New York County, Borough of Manhattan

The Honorable Darcel D. Clark  
District Attorney of Bronx County, Borough of the Bronx

The Honorable Eric Gonzalez  
District Attorney of Kings County, Borough of Brooklyn

The Honorable Melinda Katz  
District Attorney of Queens County, Borough of Queens

The Honorable Michael E. McMahon  
District Attorney of Richmond County, Borough of Staten Island