

## FOR FREEDOM OF THE PRESS

1156 15th St. NW, Suite 1020 Washington, D.C. 20005 (202) 795-9300 www.rcfp.org

Bruce D. Brown Executive Director bbrown@rcfp.org (202) 795-9301

## STEERING COMMITTEE

STEPHEN J. ADLER Reuters

J. SCOTT APPLEWHITE The Associated Press

WOLF BLITZER

CNN

DAVID BOARDMAN Temple University

THEODORE J. BOUTROUS, JR.

Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LIP

MASSIMO CALABRESI

Time Magazine
MANNY GARCIA

Pro Publica

EMILIO GARCIA-RUIZ

The Washington Post JOSH GERSTEIN

POLITICO

ALEX GIBNEY

Jigsaw Productions SUSAN GOLDBERG

National Geographic JAMES GRIMALDI

The Wall Street Journal

LAURA HANDMAN

Davis Wright Tremaine

DIEGO IBARGÜEN

Hearst

KAREN KAISER The Associated Press

DAVID LAUTER

 $Los\ Angeles\ Times$ 

MARGARET LOW

JANE MAYER The New Yorker

COLLEEN MCCAIN NELSON

The McClatchy Company

MAGGIE MULVIHILL Boston University

IAMES NEFF

The Philadelphia Inquirer

NORMAN PEARLSTINE

The Los Angeles Times
THOMAS C. RUBIN

Stanford Law School CHARLIE SAVAGE

The New York Times

IENNIFER SONDAG

Bloomberg News NABIHA SYED

The Markup

ADAM SYMSON The E.W. Scripps Company

PIERRE THOMAS

ABC News

SAUNDRA TORRY

Freelance

VICKIE WALTON-JAMES NPR

JUDY WOODRUFF

PBS/The NewsHour
HONORARY LEADERSHIP COUNCIL

CHIP BOK

Creators Syndicate
TONY MAURO

American Lawyer Media, ret.

DAHLIA LITHWICK

Slate

ANDREA MITCHELL NBC News

CAROL ROSENBERG The New York Times

PAUL STEIGER ProPublica

Affiliations appear only for purposes of identification

By email

November 6, 2020

The Honorable Bill de Blasio Mayor, City of New York City Hall New York, NY 10007

Commissioner Dermot F. Shea New York City Police Department 1 Police Plaza New York, NY 10038

Re: Arrest of journalist Chae Kihn

Dear Mayor de Blasio and Commissioner Shea:

The undersigned are members of state and local news media, national news organizations with properties in New York, wire services, and nonprofit groups that protect the rights of journalists to gather and report news. We write to ask that New York City take immediate steps to prevent another incident like the forcible arrest of Chae Kihn, an independent photographer, who was tackled by multiple NYPD officers, arrested, and charged with obstructing traffic in the lawful course of her reporting.

We urge that the charges against Ms. Kihn be dismissed. Further, the public interest would be served by an accounting from the Department explaining why she was arrested in the first place and why NYPD originally claimed that no "members of the press" had been detained. *See* Sydney Pereira & Gwynne Hogan, *Heavily Armored NYPD Officers Arrest 11 While Quashing Small Anti-Trump Protest in Manhattan*, Gothamist (Nov. 1, 2020), <a href="https://perma.cc/9WPQ-B2BR">https://perma.cc/9WPQ-B2BR</a>.

The right to document police activity in public is clearly established, and an officer who violates that First Amendment freedom—especially through the use of force—enjoys no legal immunity. *See, e.g., Higginbotham v. New York*, 105 F. Supp. 3d 369, 379-80 (S.D.N.Y. 2015); *cf.* N.Y. Civ. Rights Law § 79-P(3)(iv) (providing a cause of action for "unlawful interference with recording a law enforcement activity"). As the U.S. Department of Justice has explained, this right to record is "not only required by the Constitution" but also "consistent with our fundamental notions of liberty." Statement of Interest of the United States, *Sharp v. Baltimore City Police Dep't*, No. 1:11-cv-02888-BEL (D. Md. filed Jan. 10, 2012).

For just that reason, offenses such as "disturbing the peace" or "loitering" are rightly viewed "skeptically" when deployed against reporters. Statement of Interest of the United States, *Garcia v. Montgomery County*, No. 8:12-cv-03592-JFM (D. Md. filed March 4, 2013).

To the extent officers may order individuals who are exercising those First Amendment rights to move or disperse, such orders must be narrowly tailored to accommodate lawful reporting. *See Index Newspapers v. U.S. Marshals Service*, 2020 WL 5988501, at \*9, – F.3d – (9th Cir. 2020). At the absolute minimum, the First Amendment requires that such orders be accompanied by fair warning and a reasonable opportunity to comply. *See Jones v. Parmley*, 465 F.3d 46, 60 (2d Cir. 2006) (Sotomayor, J.); *Dellums v. Powell*, 566 F.2d 167, 181 n.31 (D.C. Cir. 1977).

Based on press reports and video from the scene, it appears the Department's arrest of Ms. Kihn violated these First Amendment rights. In <u>a recording</u> taken by Freedom News TV, Ms. Kihn appears to be moving to the sidewalk—complying with law enforcement instructions—when several officers race toward her and wrestle her to the ground. Kihn, consistent with the video, told reporters that she was "on the way" to the sidewalk when she was tackled; a journalist with *Gothamist* reported that Kihn was "chased." Valentina Di Liscia, *Photographer Arrested by NYPD While Covering Anti-Trump Demonstration*, Hyperallergic (Nov. 2, 2020), <a href="https://perma.cc/42NL-XQTL">https://perma.cc/42NL-XQTL</a>.

Kihn was also clearly identifiable as a journalist: In a <u>separate video</u> of the incident, other demonstrators can be heard loudly shouting "She's press" and "She's a reporter" as the officers arrest her. The Department has nevertheless <u>claimed</u> that Kihn was not a "member[] of the press" because she was not "NYPD credentialed." But "the newsgathering protections of the First Amendment cannot turn on professional credentials or status." *Glik v. Cunniffe*, 655 F.3d 78, 84 (1st Cir. 2011). If an officer knows or has reason to know that an individual is engaged in newsgathering, and if that individual is compliant with reasonable law enforcement requests, First Amendment protections apply. *Cf. Index Newspapers LLC v. City of Portland*, No. 3:20-cv-1035, slip op. at 58, 2020 WL 4883017, – F. Supp. 3d – (D. Or. Aug. 20, 2020), *appeal docketed*, No. 20-35739 (9th Cir. Aug. 21, 2020) (enjoining law enforcement from "arresting, threatening to arrest, or using physical force directed against any person whom they know *or reasonably should know* is a Journalist") (emphasis added).

Please find attached a letter from an earlier Reporters Committee coalition—sent to you and other officials this summer—laying out steps that law enforcement officials should take immediately to protect reporters engaged in lawful newsgathering. To support the strong public interest in coverage of police activity, we urge that the NYPD implement these steps in New York City.

Please do not hesitate to contact Bruce Brown, Executive Director of the Reporters Committee, with any questions at <a href="mailto:bbrown@rcfp.org">bbrown@rcfp.org</a>.

Sincerely,

The Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press

Committee to Protect Journalists Dow Jones & Company, Inc. The E.W. Scripps Company First Amendment Coalition First Look Media Works, Inc. Freedom of the Press Foundation

Fundamedios Inc.

Inter American Press Association International Documentary Association

The Media Institute

National Association of Broadcasters National Association of Black Journalists The National Press Club

The National Press Club Journalism Institute National Press Photographers Association New York News Publishers Association

The NewsGuild-CWA

The NewsGuild of New York News Leaders Association News Media Alliance

Radio Television Digital News Association

Society of Professional Journalists Tully Center for Free Speech

**WNET** 

cc: The Honorable Andrew Cuomo Governor, State of New York

> The Honorable Letitia James Attorney General, State of New York

The Honorable Cyrus R. Vance, Jr. District Attorney of New York County, Borough of Manhattan

The Honorable Darcel D. Clark District Attorney of Bronx County, Borough of the Bronx

The Honorable Eric Gonzalez District Attorney of Kings County, Borough of Brooklyn

The Honorable Melinda Katz District Attorney of Queens County, Borough of Queens

The Honorable Michael E. McMahon District Attorney of Richmond County, Borough of Staten Island